REDUCING RISK OF CRIMINAL BEHAVIORS

IRA K. PACKER, Ph.D., ABPP (FORENSIC)
CLINICAL PROFESSOR OF PSYCHIATRY
UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS MEDICAL SCHOOL
Violence Risk Assessment and Risk Management

- Routine part of clinical care and person-centered planning
- Incorporating individual goals in understanding the individual + knowing when there may be potential signs of trouble
- Illness Management and risk management may be lifelong
- Treatment can reduce risk of violence and arrest
  - Identification and linkages to available and appropriate treatment modalities specific to risk factors
Data regarding the association between violence and mental illness is complex.

Ongoing societal belief of a strong association between mental illness and violence is NOT substantiated.

Epidemiologic evidence indicates that major mental disorder accounts for, at most, 3% of the violence in American society.
Relative Risk of Violence among Persons with Mental Disorders

- ECA Survey
- Diagnostic Interviews
- Self report scales about violent behavior within the past year
- 10,059 respondents

(Swanson et al, H& CP 1990)
### ECA Surveys: Violence and Psychiatric Disorders in the Community (Swanson et al 1990)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diagnosis</th>
<th>Percent Violent*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No Disorder</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panic d/o</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Depression</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mania or Bipolar d/o</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schizophrenia</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cannabis Abuse/Dep</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol Abuse/Dep</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Drug Abuse/Dep</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ECA STUDY

- Did you ever hit or throw things at your wife/husband/partner?
- Have you ever spanked or hit a child, (yours on anyone else’s) hard enough so that he or she had bruises or had to stay in bed or see a doctor?
- Since age 18, have you been in more than one fight that came to swapping blows, other than fights with your husband/wife/partner?
- Have you ever used a weapon like a stick, knife, or gun in a fight since you were 18?
- Have you ever gotten into physical fights while drinking?
Mental Illness and Violence: Subsequent Analyses

- Swanson et al’s re-examination of ECA data looking at TCO symptoms (Swanson et al 1996)
  - Likelihood of persons with TCO symptoms to engage in assaultive behavior:
    - 2x more compared to other psychotic symptoms
    - 6x more likely than with no mental illness
    - 8-10x more likely than no disorder when TCO combined with SA
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study (Steadman et al 1998)

- 1000 discharged civil patients
- Three cities
- Follow-up every 10 weeks for one year
- Multiple sources of data
  - Agency records
  - Subject Report
  - Collateral sources
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study: Defining Violence

- **Violence**
  - Battery resulting in injury
  - Weapon use
  - Sexual assault

- **Other aggressive acts**
  - Battery without injury

(Steadman et al., 1998)
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study (Steadman et al 1998)

- Mental Illness Defined
  - Major Mental Disorder (MMD) ± Substance Abuse
  - Other Mental Disorder (OMD) ± Substance Abuse
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study (Steadman et al. 1998)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Info</th>
<th>% Violence by Source</th>
<th>Cumulative % with Violence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agency Records</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>23.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collateral Informant</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>27.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study (Steadman et al 1998)

- One year aggregate prevalence of violence

MMD/ -SA: 17.9%
MMD/ +SA: 31.1%
OMD/ +SA: 43.0%
Total Pt Sample: 27.5%
MacArthur Violence Risk Assessment Study (Steadman et al 1998)

- Rate of violence varied across follow-ups
- Time before and just after discharge greatest risk
- Co-occurring SA major risk factor
- Family members more likely to be targets
Re-analysis of the MacArthur Data

No clear general association of delusions or TCO symptoms and violence

Individual cases with these symptoms may be associated with violence

Methodology may have been one factor in the differential findings across studies
Variables associated with violence but not necessarily limited to delusional patients

- violence may be more associated with suspiciousness and associated anger and impulsiveness
Association of Delusions, TCO Symptoms and Violence Revisited
(Appelbaum, Robbins, Monahan, 2000)

- These findings “do not disprove the clinical wisdom that holds that persons who have acted violently in the past on the basis of delusions, may well do so again.”
- More research needed
Mental Illness and Violence: More Recent Data

- Swartz et al 1998
  - Combination of treatment nonadherence and SA strong predictor of violent behavior

- Silver, Mulvey, Monahan 1999
  - Violence 2.7x more likely in patients discharged to neighborhoods of significant poverty
National Epidemiologic Survey on Alcohol and Related Conditions (NESARC) 
Elbogen and Johnson 2009

- 34,653 subjects
- Incidence of violence higher for people with mental illness, but only significantly higher for those with co-occurring substance use disorders
- Other factors associated with violence
  - Historical (past violence, juvenile detention, history physical abuse, parental arrest record)
  - Clinical (substance abuse, perceived threats)
  - Dispositional (age, sex, income)
  - Contextual (recent divorce, unemployment, victimization)
- Persons with mental illness report these other factors more—i.e., MI puts them at risk for other factors which are related to violence
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PSYCHOSIS AND VIOLENCE?

- PSYCHOSIS INCREASES RISK RELATIVE TO COMMUNITY POPULATION
- NOT CORRELATED WITH INCREASED RISK RELATIVE TO “EXTERNALIZING” POPULATION (SUBSTANCE ABUSERS, PERSONALITY DISORDERED, PRISONERS)
Mental Illness and Violence: More Recent Data

- Swanson, et al. (2008)
  - Two groups of individuals with Schizophrenia: one group had history of childhood conduct disorder, the other did not.
  - For latter, medication adherence reduced violence, but not for former.
  - For former – treatment planning should focus on factors other than symptoms of MI.
For the most part, persons with mental illness are violent for the same reasons that persons without mental illness are violent.

Criminogenic factors

- Anti-social values and behaviors
- Negative influences (peers, neighborhoods)
- Low self-control
- Dysfunctional family ties
- Substance abuse
- Economic factors
Mental Illness and Violence

- There is a small relationship between violence and mental illness
- Most persons with mental illness not violent
- Most violence not caused by persons with mental illness
- Substance abuse is a major risk factor for violence
- IMPORTANT TO DISTINGUISH BETWEEN ROLE OF SYMPTOMS AND OTHER FACTORS
NON-VIOLENT CRIMINAL BEHAVIORS

- MANY OF THE SAME FACTORS THAT RELATE TO VIOLENCE WITHIN MI POPULATION ALSO APPLY TO OTHER CRIMES

- AGAIN, IMPORTANT TO FOCUS ON CRIMINOGENIC FACTORS
Violence History

- Past violence is one of the strongest predictors of future violence

- Historical risk factors
  - Age at first offense
  - Pattern and frequency of violence
  - Severity of violence
Historical Factors Related to Violence

- Childhood abuse/neglect
- Conduct Disorder in childhood
- Employment problems
- Relationship problems
- Psychopathic traits
- Other “externalizing” Personality Disorders
- Substance Abuse
- AWA, Violation of Probation, Parole
CURRENT CLINICAL STATUS

- CURRENT ACTIVE SYMPTOMS?
- LACK OF INSIGHT INTO FACTORS THAT INCREASE VIOLENCE
- POOR ANGER CONTROL/EASILY TRIGGERED
- LACK OF ADHERENCE TO TREATMENT
- ATTITUDES THAT FOSTER ANTISOCIAL BEHAVIORS
CONTEXT FACTORS

- IS THE ACTION PLAN FEASIBLE?
- IS THE INDIVIDUAL LIKELY TO ADHERE TO IT?
- DOES THE INDIVIDUAL HAVE A SUPPORT SYSTEM?
- EXPOSURE TO DESTABILIZERS?
- STRESS?
PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER

- NON-JUDGMENTAL
- UNDERSTAND HOW CRIMINAL BEHAVIOR CAN HAVE DELETERIOUS EFFECT ON RECOVERY

- RESULTS IN CRIMINAL JUSTICE INVOLVEMENT
  - JAIL IS NOT A THERAPEUTIC ENVIRONMENT
  - EVEN PROBATION: COERCIVE, NOT PERSON-CENTERED
  - HARDER TO FIND EMPLOYMENT, HOUSING
  - DESTRUCTIVE SPIRAL
PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER

- UNDERSTAND HOW CRIMINAL BEHAVIOR AFFECTS OTHERS
- FAMILY AND OTHER SUPPORT ARE OFTEN THE VICTIMS
PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER

- ACTION PLAN SHOULD BE SENSITIVE TO RISK FACTORS IDENTIFIED
- HOW ARE THESE ADDRESSED?
- SHOULD BE INDIVIDUALIZED